

Elections, polls and policy in South Asia
Dr Patrick Clibbens
Thursdays, 9.00 am – 11.00 am

This course will explore the politics of South Asia since Independence through a focus on elections. It approaches this issue through vibrant and ongoing debates in the fields of contemporary history, anthropology, political science and political theory. We will discuss the establishment of electoral democracy in South Asia and the changing nature of South Asian elections and electoral campaigning. The course will explore the debates about the meaning of the vote, and about the relationship between public policy, electioneering and electoral success in South Asia's diverse democracies.

India was one of the first countries of the global South to undertake opinion polls and polls are ubiquitous in Indian media today. This course will also investigate concepts of 'the public' in South Asia and the institutional production of 'public opinion', with the aim of understanding how these ideas have shaped South Asia's complex political landscape. Alongside the secondary readings listed below, we will discuss a selection of short primary texts together in each class.

General histories:

- Ali, S. Mahmud, *Understanding Bangladesh* (London, 2010).
Guha, Ramachandra, *India after Gandhi: The history of the world's largest democracy* (London, 2007)
Jaffrelot, Christophe, *The Pakistan paradox: Instability and resilience*, trans. Cynthia Schoch (London, 2015).
Jalal, Ayesha, *The state of martial rule: The origins of Pakistan's political economy of defence* (Cambridge, 1990).
Khilnani, Sunil, *The idea of India* (London, 1997).
Riaz, Ali, *Bangladesh: A political history since Independence* (London, 2016).
Talbot, Ian, *Pakistan: A new history* (London, 2012).

Approaches:

- Auerbach, Adam, et al., 'Rethinking India and the Study of Electoral Politics in the Developing World', Working Paper, 2020,
<https://vaishnavmilan.files.wordpress.com/2020/05/rethinking-india-working-paper.pdf>
Banerjee, Mukulika, *Why India votes?* (London, 2014).
Banerjee, 'Money and meaning in elections: Towards a theory of the vote', *Modern Asian Studies* (forthcoming, 2019).
Chatterjee, Partha, *The politics of the governed: Reflections on popular politics in most of the world* (New York, 2004).
Kothari, Rajni, *Politics in India* (New Delhi, 1970).
Kumar, Sanjay, and Praveen Rai, *Measuring Voting Behaviour in India* (New Delhi, 2013).
Lama-Rewal, Stéphanie Tawa, 'Studying Elections in India: Scientific and Political Debates', *SAMAJ*, vol. 3 (2009).

- Piliavsky, Anastasia (ed.), *Patronage as Politics in South Asia* (Cambridge, 2014).
- Quraishi, S.Y. (ed.), *The great march of democracy: Seven decades of India's elections* (Gurgaon, 2019).
- Yadav, Yogendra, 'Invitation to a dialogue: What work does "fieldwork" do in the field of elections?', in A.M. Shah (ed.), *The grassroots of democracy: Field studies of Indian elections* (Delhi, 2007), pp. 345-68.

Week 1: Thursday, 21 January, 9.00-11.00: Representative democracy and popular sovereignty

The first session will introduce the course by illustrating the key themes of popular sovereignty and the theory and practice of representative democracy in South Asia and globally.

- Achen, Christopher H., and Larry M. Bartels, *Democracy for realists: Why elections do not produce responsive government* (Princeton, N.J., 2016).
- Ahuja, Amit, and Pradeep Chhibber, 'Why the poor vote in India: "If I don't vote, I am dead to the state"', *Studies in Comparative International Development*, vol. 47, no. 4 (2012), 1-22.
- Banerjee, Mukulika, *Why India votes?* (London, 2014).
- Chakrabarty, Dipesh, "'In the name of politics": Sovereignty, democracy and the multitude in India', *Economic and Political Weekly*, vol. 40, no. 30 (2005), 3293-301.
- Drèze, Jean, and Amartya Sen, 'Democracy, inequality and public reasoning', in Jean Drèze and Amartya Sen, *An uncertain glory: India and its contradictions* (London, 2013), pp. 243-75.
- Gilman, Nils, *Mandarins of the future: Modernization theory in Cold War America* (Baltimore, 2007), esp. 'The elite theory of democracy', pp. 47-63.
- Gilmartin, David, 'Imperial sovereignty in Mughal and British forms', *History & Theory*, vol. 56, no. 1 (2017), 80-88.
- Gilmartin, David, 'The paradox of patronage and the people's sovereignty,' in Anastasia Piliavsky (ed.), *Patronage as politics in South Asia* (Cambridge, 2014), pp. 125-153.
- Gilmartin, David, 'Towards a Global History of Voting: Sovereignty, the Diffusion of Ideas, and the Enchanted Individual', *Religions*, vol. 3, no. 2 (2012), 407-423.
- Jayal, Niraja Gopal, 'Contending representative claims in Indian democracy', *India Review*, vol. 15, no. 2 (2016), 172-95.
- Kaviraj, Sudipta, 'Democracy and Development in India', in *The enchantment of democracy and India: Politics and ideas* (Ranikhet, 2011), pp. 116-60. Originally published in: Amiya Kumar Bagchi (ed.), *Democracy and development: Proceedings of the IEA conference held in Barcelona, Spain* (Basingstoke, 1995), pp. 92-130.
- Khan Mohmand, Shandana, *Crafty Oligarchs, Savvy Voters: Democracy under Inequality in Rural Pakistan* (Cambridge, 2019).

- Parry, Jonathan P., 'The "crisis of corruption" and "the idea of India": a worm's eye view', in I. Pardo (ed.), *The morals of legitimacy* (New York; Oxford, 2000), pp 27-55.
- Przeworski, Adam, *Why bother with elections?* (Cambridge, 2018).
- Quraishi, S.Y. (ed.), *The great march of democracy: Seven decades of India's elections* (Gurgaon, 2019).
- Ryan, Alan, 'Democracy in the modern world', in *On politics: A history of political thought from Herodotus to the present* (London, 2012), pp. 946-77.

Week 2: Thursday, 28 January, 9.00-11.00: Constructing democracy in South Asia

This session will focus on the creation and negation of electoral democracy in India and Pakistan in the decades immediately before and after Independence.

- Chiriyankandath, James. "'Democracy" under the Raj: Elections and separate representation in British India', *Journal of Commonwealth and Comparative Politics*, vol. 30, no. 1 (1992), 39-63.
- Gilmartin, David, 'Election law and the "people" in colonial and postcolonial India', in Dipesh Chakrabarty, Rochona Mazumdar and Andrew Sartori (eds.), *From the colonial to the postcolonial: India and Pakistan in transition* (New Delhi, 2007), pp. 55-82.
- Kamran, Tahir, 'Early phase of electoral politics in Pakistan: 1950s', *South Asian Studies*, vol. 24, no. 2 (2009), 257-82.
- Kamran, Tahir, 'Electoral politics in Pakistan (1955-1969)', *Pakistan Vision*, vol. 10, no. 1 (2010), 82-97.
- Kothari, Rajni, 'The Congress "system" in India', *Asian Survey*, vol. 4, no. 12 (1964), 1161-73.
- Manor, James, 'How and why liberal and representative politics emerged in India', *Political Studies*, vol. 38, no. 1 (1990), pp. 20-38.
- Naqvi, Tahir H., 'Nation, space and exception: Pakistan's Basic Democracies experiment', *Comparative Studies of South Asia, Africa and the Middle East*, vol. 33, no. 3 (2013), 279-94.
- Singer, Wendy, 'The 15 per cent solution: Women as a special category in early Indian elections', in Wendy Singer, *'A constituency suitable for ladies' and other social histories of Indian elections* (New Delhi, 2007), pp. 62-88.
- Shani, Ornit, *How India Became Democratic: Citizenship and the Making of the Universal Franchise* (Cambridge, 2017).

Week 3: Thursday, 4 February, 9.00-11.00: Elections and populism

This class will focus on elections that took place under 'populist' leaders in India, Pakistan and Bangladesh. It will explore whether and how these populists changed the prevalent ideas about popular sovereignty and introduced new methods of electioneering. It will place South Asian populism in the context of wider debates in political theory.

- Bhuwania, Anuj, 'Courting the people: The rise of public interest litigation in post-Emergency India', *Comparative Studies of South Asia, Africa and the Middle East*, vol. 34, no. 2 (2014), 314-35.
- Burki, Shahid Javed, *Pakistan under Bhutto, 1971-1977*, 2nd edn (Basingstoke, 1988), esp. chs 8-9, pp. 171-220.
- Chatterjee, Partha, *I Am the People: Reflections on Popular Sovereignty Today* (New York, 2019).
- Jaffrelot, Christophe and Louise Tillin, 'Populism in India', in Cristóbal Rovira Kaltwasser et al. (eds.), *The Oxford handbook of populism* (Oxford, 2017), pp. 179-94.
- Jalal, A. *Democracy and authoritarianism in South Asia: A comparative and historical perspective* (Cambridge, 1995).
- Kaviraj, Sudipta, 'Indira Gandhi and Indian Politics', *Economic and Political Weekly*, vol. 21, nos 38/9 (1986), 1697-708.
- Müller, Jan-Werner, *What is populism?* (Philadelphia, 2016).
- Pandian, M.S.S., *The image trap: MG Ramachandran in film and politics* (New Delhi, 1992).
- Rudolph, Susanne Hoeber, and Lloyd I. Rudolph, 'Congress learns to lose: From a one-party dominant to a multiparty system in India', in Edward Friedman and Joseph Wong (eds.) *Political transitions in Dominant Party Systems: Learning to Lose* (London, 2008), pp. 15-41.
- Shah, A.M., 'Introduction', in A.M. Shah (ed.), *The grassroots of democracy: Field studies of Indian elections* (Delhi, 2007), pp. 1-27.
- Sisson, Richard, and Leo E. Rose, *War and secession: Pakistan, India and the creation of Bangladesh* (Berkeley, Calif., 1990), esp. ch. 2.
- Zaidi, S. Akbar, 'Special report: The triumph of populism 1971-1973', *Dawn* (2017) [<https://www.dawn.com/news/1360571>].

Week 4: Thursday, 11 February, 9.00-11.00: Contemporary elections

This class will look at the elections that have taken place in South Asia in the last two decades, which have witnessed an uneven democratisation in Pakistan and the rise of the BJP in India. It will consider whether established ideas about the Pakistani state, the dominance of state-level politics over national politics, and the Indian party system have been overturned in recent years.

- Ahmad, Irfan, and Pralay Kanungo (eds), *The algebra of warfare-welfare: A long view of India's 2014 election* (New Delhi, 2019).
- Ahmed Yusuf, 'Elections 2018: Mapping the trends', *Dawn* (2 September 2018) [<https://www.dawn.com/news/1430121>]
- Diwakar, Rekha, 'Change and continuity in Indian politics and the Indian party system: Revisiting the results of the 2014 Indian general election', *Asian Journal of Political Science*, vol. 2, no. 4 (2017), 327-46.
- Fair, C. Christine, 'Bangladesh in 2018: Careening toward one-woman rule', *Asian Survey*, vol. 59, no. 1 (2019), 124-32.

- 'How India voted: A symposium on the results of the 2019 general election', *Seminar*, no. 720 (2019), [<https://www.india-seminar.com/2019/720.htm>].
- Jha, Prashant, *How the BJP wins: Inside India's greatest election machine* (New Delhi, 2017).
- Martin, Nicolas, *Politics, landlords and Islam in Pakistan* (Abingdon, 2016), esp. ch. 3, 'Electoral politics and the reproduction of inequality', pp. 66-92.
- Palshikar, Suhas, Sanjay Kumar and Sanjay Lodha (eds.), *Electoral politics in India: The resurgence of the Bharatiya Janata Party* (Abingdon, 2017).
- Samad, Yunus, 'Elections and democratic transition in Pakistan: one step forward and two steps backwards', *Commonwealth & Comparative Politics*, vol. 55, no. 4 (2017), 509-30.
- Shah, Aqil, 'Pakistan in 2018: Theft of an election', *Asian Survey*, vol. 59, no. 1 (2019), 98-107.
- Waseem, Mohammad, *Democratization in Pakistan: A study of the 2002 elections* (Karachi, 2006).
- Wilder, Andrew R., *The Pakistani voter: Electoral politics and voting behaviour in the Punjab* (Karachi, 1999).
- Wilkinson, Steven, 'Elections in India: Behind the Congress comeback', *Journal of Democracy*, vol. 16, no. 1 (2005), 153-67.
- Yadav, Yogendra, and Suhas Palshikar, 'Ten theses on state politics in India', *Seminar* 591 (2008) [http://www.india-seminar.com/2008/591/591_y_yadav_&_s_palshkar.htm]

Week 5: Thursday, 18 February, 9.00-11.00: Polling

This class will consider the emergence of opinion polling in India in the 1950s and 1960s and its limitations, its proliferation across South Asia in recent decades, and the role that polls have come to play in elections and politicians' thinking.

- Bhaskara Rao, N., 'Poll surveys: The Indian scene', in *A handbook of poll surveys in media: an Indian perspective* (New Delhi, 2010).
- da Costa E.P.W., *The Indian General Elections: The Structure of Indian Voting Intentions: January 1967* (New Delhi: Indian Institute of Public Opinion, 1967).
- Dixon, John, 'Eric P.W. Da Costa: Polling pioneer of India', *International Journal of Public Opinion Research*, vol. 18, no. 1 (2006).
- Eldersveld, Samuel J., 'The Political behavior of the Indian public', *Indian Institute of Public Opinion, Monthly Public Opinion Surveys* 9 (1964), 4-9.
- Gilani, Ijaz Shafi, *Voice of the people: Public opinion in Pakistan 2007-2009* (Karachi, 2010).
- Kaushik, Krishn, 'Spot On', *Caravan* (1 December 2013) [<http://www.caravanmagazine.in/reportage/spot/2>]
- Mattes, Robert, 'Public opinion research in emerging democracies', in Wolfgang Donsbach and Michael W. Traugott (eds.), *The SAGE Handbook of Public Opinion Research* (Los Angeles, 2008), pp. 113-22.

- ‘Measuring Democracy: A symposium on the state of election surveys in India’, *Seminar* no. 684 (2016), esp. Kumar, Rai & Gupta.
- Oldenburg, Philip, ‘Pollsters, pundits and a mandate to rule: Interpreting India’s 1984 parliamentary elections’, *Journal of Commonwealth & Comparative Politics*, vol. 26, no. 3 (1988), 296-317.
- Rai, Praveen, ‘Status of opinion polls: Media gimmick and political communication in India’ *Economic and Political Weekly*, vol. 49, no. 16 (2014).
- Roy, Prannoy, and Dorab R. Sopariwala, *The Verdict: Decoding India’s elections* (2019).
- Rudolph, Lloyd, and Susanne H. Rudolph, ‘Surveys in India: Field experience in Madras state’, *Public Opinion Quarterly*, vol. 22, no. 3 (1958), 235-44.

Week 6: Thursday, 25 February, 9.00-11.00: Electioneering and political candidacy

In this class, we will discuss the politics of candidacy and the process of ‘getting a ticket’. The class will also consider changing methods of electioneering and campaigning in South Asian politics, including visual media and new social media.

- Bajaj, Shelly Ghai, ‘The Use of Twitter during the 2014 Indian general Elections Framing, Agenda-Setting, and the Personalization of Politics’, *Asian Survey*, vol. 57, no. 2 (2017), 249-70.
- Chaturvedi, Swati, *I Am A Troll: Inside the Secret World of the BJP’s Digital Army* (New Delhi, 2016).
- Chhibber, Pradeep K., and Rahul Verma, ‘The myth of vote buying in India’, in *Ideology and identity: The changing party systems of India* (New York, 2018).
- Dadi, Iftikhar, ‘Political posters in Karachi, 1988-1999’, *South Asian Popular Culture*, vol. 5, no. 1 (2007), 11-30.
- Manor, James, ‘India’, in David Butler and Austin Ranney (eds.), *Electioneering: A comparative study of continuity and change* (Oxford, 1992), pp. 110-32.
- Siddiqui, Dina Mahnaz, ‘Political culture in contemporary Bangladesh: Histories, ruptures and contradictions’, in Ali Riaz and C. Christine Fair (eds.), *Political Islam and Governance in Bangladesh* (London, 2010), pp. 7-26.
- Singer, Wendy, ‘Rhetoric, culture, and elections on the ground’, in Wendy Singer, *‘A constituency suitable for ladies’ and other social histories of Indian elections* (New Delhi, 2007), pp. 157-85.
- Vaishnav, Milan, ‘The costs of democracy: How money fuels muscle in elections’, in *When crime pays: Money and muscle in Indian politics* (New Haven, 2017), pp. 115-56.
- Willnat, Lars, Roshni Verghese and Rashad Mammadov, ‘Symbols, slogans, and charisma: Political posters in India’s 2014 national election’, in Christina Holtz-Bacha and Bengt Johansson (eds.), *Election posters around the globe: Political campaigning in the public space* (Cham, 2017), pp. 187-209.

Week 7: Thursday, 4 March, 9.00-11.00: Public opinion and public policy

This week will focus on the relationship between public opinion and public policy, using two case studies: the development and testing of nuclear weapons by India and Pakistan in the 1990s; and economic liberalisation and employment guarantees in the 1990s and 2000s.

Auerbach, Adam, et al., 'Rethinking India and the Study of Electoral Politics in the Developing World', Working Paper, 2020,
<https://vaishnavmilan.files.wordpress.com/2020/05/rethinking-india-working-paper.pdf>

Verma, Rahul, 'What determines electoral outcomes in India? caste, class or voters' satisfaction with government performance?', *Asian Survey*, vol. 52, no. 2 (2012), 270-97.

Economic reforms

Bardhan, Pranab, 'Democracy and Distributive Politics in India'

[<https://eml.berkeley.edu/~webfac/bardhan/papers/BardhDemoDist.pdf>]

Jenkins, Rob, *Democratic politics and economic reform in India* (Cambridge, 1999).

Jenkins, Rob, and James Manor, *Politics and the right to work: India's National Rural Employment Guarantee Act* (New York, 2017).

Sinha, Aseema, 'Why has "development" become a political issue in Indian politics?' *Brown Journal of World Affairs*, vol. 23, no. 1 (2016), 189-203.

Thompson, Helen, *Might, right and prosperity: Representative democracy and the international economy, 1919-2001* (Manchester, 2008), esp. ch. 4.

Zaidi, A., *Issues in Pakistan's Economy: A political economy perspective*, 3rd edn (Karachi, 2015), chapters 26-7.

The bomb

Ahmed, Samina, and David Cortright, 'Pakistani Public Opinion and Nuclear Weapons Policy', in Samina Ahmed and David Cortright, *Pakistan and the bomb: Public opinion and nuclear options* (Oxford, 2000), pp. 3-28.

Clary, Christopher, 'Parties and Foreign Policy in Pakistan', in Niloufer Siddiqui, Mariam Mufti and Sahar Shafqat (eds), *Pakistan's Political Parties: Against All Odds* (Washington, D.C., 2020), pp. 251-73.

Cortright, David, and Amitabh Mattoo (ed.), *India and the bomb: Public opinion and nuclear options* (Notre Dame, Ind., 1996).

Kapur, Devesh, 'Public Opinion', in David M. Malone, C. Raja Mohan and Srinath Raghavan (eds.), *The Oxford handbook of Indian foreign policy* (Oxford, 2015), pp. 298-311.

Kaur, Raminder, 'Nuclear Revelations', in Raminder Kaur and William Mazzarella (eds.), *Censorship in South Asia: Cultural regulation from sedition to seduction* (Bloomington, Ind., 2009), pp. 140-71.

Sen, Amartya, 'India and the Bomb', Dorothy Hodgkin Memorial Lecture (2000) [<https://britishpugwash.org/india-and-the-bomb/>]; revised version published as Amartya Sen, 'India and the Bomb', in *The Argumentative Indian: Writings on Indian History, Culture and Identity* (London, 2005), pp. 251-69.