**The Crisis of Multilateralism - Causes, Consequences, Cures?**

**Michaelmas 2020-2021**

**Time: 9-11am Wednesday, starting on 14th October 2020.**

*Mette Eilstrup-Sangiovanni*

Multilateral organizations have come under increasing fire during the past few decades. Around the world, the tide seems to be shifting away from globalization and global governance towards growing economic and political nationalism. Failure to solve the European and global financial crises or to agree binding targets for global Co2 emissions, cuts to the funding of international organizations like the WHO, and high-profile state withdrawals from, *inter alia*, the European Union, the International Criminal Court, UNESCO, the World Trade Organization, and the Trans-Pacific Partnership are viewed by many as signs of a multilateral system in crisis. Ditto political developments in the United States which call into question the future of security institutions which have formed the bedrock of the international order since World War II - including NATO. But we have also witnessed the rise of new multilateral institutions such as the Asian Infrastructure Investment Bank. To what extent is global multilateralism in crisis? If so, what are the main sources of dissatisfaction with incumbent institutions for global governance? And how might long-standing international organizations cope with growing discontent and challenges to their legitimacy?

Learning Goals:

This course will explore current debates about the effectiveness, legitimacy and resilience of contemporary institutions of global governance. Different forms of multilateral governance will be surveyed, including both formal and informal international institutions, and public and private governance initiatives. The focus will be on the extent to which multilateral governance in crisis, and if so, why, and with what consequences. The course will not provide a primer on theories of international cooperation, so students lacking a background in this field may find it helpful to attend POL3 lectures.

The aim of the course is to stimulate discussion. The expectation is that you will devote the time and energy to read the assigned material in a careful and critical fashion, and make informedcontributions in seminar discussions.

Assessment:

The Module will be assessed by a single, 3,000 word essay. Essay titles and submission arrangements will be given out in the first session. This will be due on 4th December 2020.

**I. Foundations of Multilateralism**

Ruggie, John. 1992. “Multilateralism: the anatomy of an institution.” *International Organization*, Vol. 46, No. 3, pp. 561-598.

Keohane, Robert O. 1984. *After Hegemony*. Princeton University Press, Chapters 4 and 6, pp. 49-65; 85-109. (OR Ruggie: *Multilateralism Matters: The Theory and Praxis of an International Forum*. New York: Columbia University Press, Chapter 1).

Pouliot, Vincent. 2011. “Multilateralism as an End in Itself.” *International Studies Perspectives,* Vol.12, No.1, pp. 18-26.

Abbott, Kenneth W. and Duncan Snidal. 1998. “Why States Act Through Formal International Organizations.” *The Journal of Conflict Resolution,* Vol. 42, No. 1, pp. 3-32.

Ikenberry, G. John. 2009. “Liberal Internationalism 3.0: America and the Dilemma of Liberal World Order.” *Perspectives on Politics*, Vol. 7, No. 1, pp. 71-88.

Recommended

Ikenberry, G. John. 2011. *Liberal Leviathan: the origins, crisis, and transformation of the American world order* (Princeton University Press).

Krasner, Stephen. 1983. “Structural causes and regime consequences: Regimes as intervening variables.” In S. Krasner (ed.) *International Regimes* (Cornell University Press), Chapter 1, pp. 1-21.

Martin, Lisa. 1992. “Interests, Power, and Multilateralism.” *International Organization,* Vol. 46, No. 4, pp. 765-792.

**II. Multilateralism Under Challenge? Power Shift and Structural Change**

Ikenberry, G. John. 2018. “The end of liberal international order?” International Affairs, Vol. 94, No. 1, pp. 7–23.

Newman, Edward, Ramesh Thakur and John Tirman. *Multilateralism Under Challenge*: *Power, international order, and structural change* (United Nations University Press), Chapter 1, ‘Introduction’, pp. 1-15 (https://collections.unu.edu/eserv/UNU:2470/pdf9280811290.pdf)

Guzzini, Stefano. 2006. “From (alleged) unipolarity to the decline of multilateralism?
A power-theoretical critique.” In Edward Newman, Ramesh Thakur and John Tirman. *Multilateralism Under Challenge* (United Nations University Press), chapter 7, pp. 119 -138 (https://collections.unu.edu/eserv/UNU:2470/pdf9280811290.pdf)

Boyle, Michael J. 2016. ‘The coming illiberal era’, *Survival,* Vol. 58, No. 2.

Bearce, David H. and Brandy J. Jolliff. 2019. “Popular non-support for international organizations: How extensive and what does this represent?” *Review of International Organization*, Vol. 14, No. 2, pp. 187-216.

Bisbee, James, Layna Mosley, Thomas B. Pepinsky and Peter Rosendorf. 2019. “Decompensating domestically: the political economy of anti-globalism.” *Journal of European Public Policy*, First View Online, October 2019.

Walter, Stefanie. 2020. “The political contagion effects of voter-based disintegration. How Brexit encourages and deters exit demands abroad” (paper to be circulated by course-leader).

Recommended Reading

Mead, Walter Russell. 2014. “The Return of Geopolitics: The Revenge of Revisionist Powers.” *Foreign Affairs*, May/June.

Ikenberry, G. John. 2011. “The Future of the Liberal World Order Internationalism After America.” *Foreign Affairs*, May/June.

Charles Glaser. 2019. “A Flawed Framework. Why the Liberal International Order Concept Is Misguided.” *International Security,* Vol. 43, No. 4, pp. 51–87,

Robert Kagan. 2013. *The world America made* (New York: Vintage).

Amitav Acharya. 2014. *The end of American world order.* (Cambridge: Polity Press).

Ulrich Speck. 2016. ‘The crisis of liberal order’, *The American Interest*, 12 Sept.

**III. New Governance Approaches: From International Cooperation to Global Governance**

Rosenau, James. 1992. *Governance without Government*. Cambridge University Press, Chapter 1, pp. 1-24 and any of the chapters that catch your interest: <https://cil.nus.edu.sg/wp-content/uploads/2019/08/j.-Governance-without-Government-Order-and-Change-in-World-Politics-pp-1-30.pdf>

Matthews, Jessica T. 1997. “Power Shift.” *Foreign Affairs*, Vol. 76, No. 1, pp. 50–66.

Abbott, Kenneth W., Jessica. F. Green, Robert. O. Keohane. 2016. “Organizational Ecology and Institutional Change in Global Governance,” *International Organization,* Vol. 70, No. 2, pp. 247–77.

Abbott, Kenneth W. 2012. “Strengthening International Regulation Through Transnational New Governance: Overcoming the Orchestration Deficit.” Vanderbilt Journal of Transnational Law, Vol. 42, No. 2, pp. 501-578.

Andonova, Liliana B. 2010. "Public-Private Partnerships for the Earth: Politics and Patterns of Hybrid Authority in the Multilateral System." *Global Environmental Politics* 10, 2: 25-53.

Recommended

Strange, Susan. 1996. *Retreat of the State: The Diffusion of Power in the World Economy* (Cambridge University Press), Chapter 1.

Avant, Deborah, Martha Finnemore, and Susan Sell (eds.). 2010. *Who Governs the Globe*? (Cambridge University Press), Chapter 1, pp. 1-31.

Snidal, Duncan and Felicity Vabulas. 2013. “Organization without Delegation: Informal intergovernmental organizations (IIGOs).” *Review of International Organizations* Vol. 8, No. 2, pp. 193-220.

Tsigou, Eleni. 2015. “Club Governance and the Making of Global Financial Rules.”, *Review of**International Political Economy* Vol. 22, No 2.

Shah Sonia. 2011. “How Private Companies are Transforming the Global Public Health Agenda.” *Foreign Affairs*, 9 November. https://www.foreignaffairs.com/articles/2011-11-09/how-private-companies-are-transforming-global-public-health-agenda

Acharya, Amitav. 2014. “Post-hegemonic multilateralism.” In Thomas G. Weiss and Rorden Wilkinson (eds.) *Global Governance and International Organizations* (Routledge), pp. 192-204. OR Acharya. 2017. “Global Governance in a Multiplex World. RSCAS 2017/29. <https://cadmus.eui.eu/bitstream/handle/1814/46849/RSCAS_2017_29.pdf?sequence=1&isAllowed=y>

Abbott, Kenneth W., Genschel, Philipp and Snidal, Duncan and Zangl, Bernhard, Orchestration: Global Governance through Intermediaries (SSRN: [https://ssrn.com/abstract=2125452](https://ssrn.com/abstract%3D2125452) or [http://dx.doi.org/10.2139/ssrn.2125452](https://dx.doi.org/10.2139/ssrn.2125452)

**IV. Legal Fragmentation and Regime Complexity: Contested Multilateralism or a New System of Flexible Transnational Governance?**

Benvenisti, Eyal and George W. Downs. 2007. “The Empire’s New Cloths: Political Economy and the Fragmentation of International Law.” *Stanford Law Review,* Vol. 60, No, 2. pp. 595-631.

Alter, Karen J., and Sophie Meunier. 2009. “The Politics of International Regime Complexity.” *Perspectives on Politics* Vol. 7, No. 1, pp. 13-24.

Drezner, Daniel W. 2009. “The Power and Peril of International Regime Complexity,” *Perspectives on Politics* Vol. 7, No. 1, pp. 13-24.

Morse, Julia C. and Robert O. Keohane. 2014. “Contested Multilateralism.” *The Review of International Organizations* 9, 4: 385-412.

Kahler, Miles. 2016. “Complex Governance and the New Interdependence Approach (NIA),” *Review of International Political Economy,* Vol. 23, No. 5, pp. 825-39.

Zürn, Michael. 2017. "From Constitutional Rule to Loosely Coupled Spheres of Liquid Authority. A Reflexive Approach." *International Theory - A Journal of International Politics, Law and Philosophy,* Vol. 9, No. 2, pp. 261-285.

Benjamin Faude. 2020. “Breaking Gridlock: How Path Dependent Layering Enhances Resilience in Global Trade Governance.” *Global Policy* doi: 10.1111/1758-5899.12822

Recommended

Biermann, Frank, Philipp Pattberg, Harro van Asselt, and Fariborz Zelli. 2009. “The fragmentation of global governance architectures: A framework for analysis.” *Global Environmental Politics* 9, 4: 14– 40.

Victor, David G., and Robert O. Keohane. 2011. “The Regime Complex for Climate Change.” *Perspectives on Politics* 9 (1):7-23.

**V. Losing Legitimacy or Losing Relevance?**

# Martin Binder and Monika Heupel. 2015. “The Legitimacy of the UN Security Council: Evidence from Recent General Assembly Debates”. International Studies Quarterly, Vol. 59, pp. 238-250.

# Zürn, Michael, Martin Binder, Matthias Ecker-Ehrhardt. 2012. "International Authority and Its Politicization". *International Theory - A Journal of International Politics, Law and Philosophy* Vol. 4, No, 1, pp. 69- 106.

Panke, Diana, and Ulrich Petersohn. 2012. “Why International Norms Disappear Sometimes.” *European Journal of International Relations,* Vol. 18, No. 4, pp. 719–42.

Dingwerth, Klaus, Witt, Antonia, Lehmann, Ina, Reichel, Ellen, and Weise, Tobias (Eds), *International Organizations under Pressure*, Oxford: Oxford University Press, Chapter 1.

Faude, Benjamin and Felex Große-Kreul. 2020. “Let’s Justify! How Regime Complexes Enhance the Normative Legitimacy of Global Governance”, *International Studies Quarterly*, 1–9.

Aart Scholte and Jonas Tallberg. 2028. “Theorizing the Institutional Sources of Global Governance Legitimacy.” In Jonas Tallberg, Karin Bäckstrand and Jan Aart Scholte (Eds.), *Legitimacy in Global Governance* (Oxford University Press), Chapter 4.

Bäckstrand, Karin and Fredrik Söderbaum. 2018. “Legitimation and Delegitimation in Global Governance.” In Jonas Tallberg, Karin Bäckstrand and Jan Aart Scholte (Eds.), *Legitimacy in Global Governance* (Oxford University Press), Chapter 6.

Recommended

Matthew D. Stephen. 2018. “Legitimacy Deficits of International Organizations: design, drift, and decoupling at the UN Security Council.” *Cambridge Review of International Affairs,*Vol. 31, No. 1, pp. 96-120.

Lenz, Tobias and Lora Viola. 2017. “Legitimacy and Institutional Change in International Organizations: A Cognitive Approach.” *Review of International Studies* 43(5): 939–61.

Hurd, I. (2018) Legitimacy and contestation in global governance: Revisiting the folk theory of international institutions. The Review of International Organizations <https://doi.org/10.1007/s11558-018-9338-z>.

Dellmuth, L.M., & Tallberg, J. (forthcoming). Why National and International Legitimacy Are Linked: Social Trust as an Antecedent Factor. *Review of International Organizations*.

Gregoratti, C., & Uhlin, A. (2018). Civil Society Protest and the (De)Legitimation of Global Governance Institutions. In J. Tallberg, K. Bäckstrand, & J. A. Scholte (Eds.), Legitimacy in Global Governance (Oxford: Oxford University Press)

Hooghe, L., Lenz, T., & Marks, G. (2019) Contested world order: The de-legitimation of international governance. *The Review of International Organizations* **14:** 731–743.

Zürn, M. (2004). Global Governance and Legitimacy Problems. Government and Opposition, 39(2), 260–287.

Tallberg, Jonas and Michael Zürn. 2019. “The Legitimacy and Legitimation of International Organization: Introduction and Framework.” *Review of International Organizations* 14(4): 581–606.

**VI. Clinging on or Fighting Back**

Barnett, Michael N. and Martha Finnemore. 1999. “The Politics, Power, and Pathologies of International Organizations.” *International Organization* 53, 4: 699-732.

Bernholz, P. (2009). Are international organizations like the Bank for International Settlements Unable to die? *Review of International Organizations, 4*, 361–381.

McCalla, R. (1996). “NATO’s persistence after the cold war.” *International Organization,* Vol. 50, No. 3, pp. 445–476.

Klaus Hüfner. 2017. The Financial Crisis of UNESCO after 2011: Political Reactions and Organizational Consequences.” Global Policy vol. 8 (S5), pp. 96-101

Gronau, Jennifer and Henning Schmidtke. 2016. “The Quest for Legitimacy in World Politics: International Institutions' Legitimation Strategies.” *Review of International Studies* 42(3):535-57.

Littoz-Monnet, A. 2017.*The Politics of Expertise in International Organizations. How**International Bureaucracies Produce and Mobilize Knowledge* (London, Routledge), Chapter 1: Introduction.

Recommended

*Fiona Godlee. 1994.* The World Health Organisation: WHO in crisis, BMJ, Vo. 309. doi: <https://doi.org/10.1136/bmj.309.6966.1424>.

**VII. A System Out of Order or ‘Business as Usual’?**

Edward Newman and Ramesh Thakur: Conclusions: Multilateralism under challenge or in crisis? In Newman, Thakur and Tirman. *Multilateralism Under Challenge*. United Nations University Press, chapter 25, pp. 531-538.

Edward Newman. “Multilateral crises in historical perspective.” In Newman, Thakur and Tirman. *Multilateralism Under Challenge.* United Nations University Press, pp. 160.

Mette Eilstrup-Sangiovanni and Stephanie C. Hofmann, 2020. “Of the Contemporary Global Order, Crisis, and Change.” *Journal of European Public Policy*. First View Online October 2019.

Zürn, Michael. 2018. ‘Contested global governance’, *Global Policy* Vol. 9, No 1, pp. 138–45

Copelovitch, Mark, Sara B. Hobolt and Stefanie Walter. 2019. “Challenges to the contemporary global order. Cause for pessimism or optimism? Journal of European Public Policy. First View Online, October 2019,

Mette Eilstrup-Sangiovanni. 2019. “Death of International Organizations: The Organizational Ecology of Intergovernmental Organizations, 1815-2015.” *Review of International Organization*, pp. 339-370